Reviewing for *Pediatric Radiology*

Geetika Khanna, MD, MS
Assistant Editor- Pediatric Radiology
Associate Professor-Mallinckrodt Institute of Radiology
General Comments

• A thoughtful review of a manuscript is a gift
  — Expertise
  — Time
  — Careful consideration

• Approach as if it were your own paper

• Be kind, but be honest

• Complete confidentiality
Title and Abstract

- Key to successful electronic retrieval
- The most frequently read parts of the manuscript
- **Title:**
  - Succinct
  - Informative (Reflect the contents of the manuscript)
  - Capture the attention of the reader
The title of your manuscript is usually the first introduction readers have to your published work. Therefore, you must select a title that grabs attention, accurately describes the contents of your manuscript, and makes people want to read further.

An effective title should:

- Convey the main topics of the study
- Highlight the importance of the research
- Be concise
- Attract readers

Writing a good title for your manuscript can be challenging. First, list the topics covered by the manuscript. Try to put all of the topics together in the title using as few words as possible. A title that is too long will seem clumsy, annoy readers, and probably not meet journal requirements.
The Title

*Does Vaccinating Children and Adolescents with Inactivated Influenza Virus Inhibit the Spread of Influenza in Unimmunized Residents of Rural Communities?*

This title has too many unnecessary words.

*Influenza Vaccination of Children: A Randomized Trial*

This title doesn’t give enough information about what makes the manuscript interesting.

*Effect of Child Influenza Vaccination on Infection Rates in Rural Communities: A Randomized Trial*

This is an effective title. It is short, easy to understand, and conveys the important aspects of the research.

Editor(s) will often work with the title, but your opinion is valuable
The Abstract

If the title interests them, the second thing that they will read (and maybe that’s all)

Specific formats for each article type
  Structured, paragraph, none

Read the abstract first
Read the paper
Read the abstract again
The Abstract

The abstract should answer:

What was done?
Why did they do it?
What did they find?
Why should we care?

Consistent with the manuscript
Independently comprehensive
Key Words

Should not be an afterthought
Important for searches and finding paper
Should accurately reflect paper
Should be as specific as possible
The Introduction

The third thing a reader will look at
Should *briefly* expand upon the background and objective for the manuscript

   Why did they do this and why is it relevant?

*Not* the place for literature review or results
The Introduction

Should *not* read like a discussion
Should *not* have exhaustive references

*Brief*

No more than 2 MS pages
No more than 1.5 is better
Materials and Methods

• Subjects and methods/Patients and methods
• The most critical part of the manuscript
• Blueprint/recipe of the paper
• Flaws in study design
  – Questionable credibility
  – Fatal
• Ethical Concerns
Materials and Methods

- IRB approval
- Study Design
- Patient population (inclusion/exclusion criteria)
- Imaging equipment/techniques
- Guidelines for image interpretation
- Data analysis methods
Materials and Methods
Flaw in study design

• If the study design is flawed, the hypothesis cannot be appropriately evaluated

• Example
Results

• Answers to all questions proposed in materials and methods
• Order of results should parallel materials and methods section
• Key results in manuscript text
• Details/specifics in tabulate format
• Data:
  – Provide numerator/denominator (%age alone not enough)
  – 95% CI
  – P-value
Review Process - Scientific Expertise

Suggested Changes:
1. In the title, change "appearance" in line 3 of page 1 to "appearances."
2. Delete "the" before VEPTR in line 8 of page 1.
3. Change "deformity" in line 9 of page 1 to "deformities."
4. Change "appearance" in line 9 of page 1 to "appearances."
5. Change the semi-colon in line 11 of page 1 to "and."
6. Change "configuration" in line 20 of page 1 to "configurations."
7. Change "parenchyma" in line 22 of page 1 to "parenchymal expansion."